On Four Velocity and Four Momentum

Anamitra Palit

Free lancer, Physicist

P154 Motijheel Avenue, Flat C4, Kolkata 700074, India

palit.anamitra@gmail.com

Cell: +919163892336

Abstract

We derive in this article that the four dot product between two arbitrary velocities is less than the square of the speed of light in vacuum and the product of two four momenta is less than the product of the two masses involved and the square of the speed of light[in vacuuo]. Based on these results we strive to show a contradiction. Flat spacetime has been considered.

Introduction

The writing concerns itself with a derivation that the four dot product of two arbitrary velocities is less than c^2 , c being the speed of light in vacuum and that the four dot product of two arbitrary four momenta is less than $m_1m_2c^2$. Finally we arrive at acontradiction. We have considered flat space time in the article.

A Mathematical Result

First we consider the following result:

For arbitrary real numbers a_1 , a_2 , b_1 and b_2 ,

$$(a_1b_1 - a_2b_2)^2 \ge (a_1^2 - a_2^2)(b_1^2 - b_2^2)$$
 (1)

Proof:
$$(a_1b_1 - a_2b_2)^2 - (a_1^2 - a_2^2) (b_1^2 - b_2^2)$$

$$= a_1^2b_1^2 + a_2^2b_2^2 - 2a_1a_2b_1b_2 - (a_1^2b_1^2 + a_2^2b_2^2 - a_1^2b_2^2 - a_2^2b_1^2)$$

$$= a_1^2b_2^2 + a_2^2b_1^2 - 2a_1a_2b_1b_2$$

$$= (a_1b_2 - a_2b_1)^2 \ge 0$$
Therefore
$$(a_1b_1 - a_2b_2)^2 - (a_1^2 - a_2^2) (b_1^2 - b_2^2) \ge 0$$

$$(a_1b_1 - a_2b_2)^2 > (a_1^2 - a_2^2) (b_1^2 - b_2^2)$$

Or,

Either
$$(a_1b_1 - a_2b_2) \ge \sqrt{{a_1}^2 - {a_2}^2} \sqrt{{b_1}^2 - {b_2}^2}$$
 or $a_1b_1 - a_2b_2 \le -\sqrt{{a_1}^2 - {a_2}^2} \sqrt{{b_1}^2 - {b_2}^2}$

Dot Product of Two Four Velocities

Using the above result we will prove that the four velocity^[1] dot product^[2],

$$v_1. v_2 >= c^2$$
 (2)

Proof: First we consider the relations

$$1)c^{2}v_{1t}.v_{2t} - |\vec{v}_{1}||\vec{v}_{2}| \ge \sqrt{c^{2}v_{1t}^{2} - |\vec{v}_{1}|^{2}}\sqrt{c^{2}v_{12t}^{2} - |\vec{v}_{2}|^{2}}$$

$$2)c^{2}v_{1t}.v_{2t} - |\vec{v}_{1}||\vec{v}_{2}| \le -\sqrt{c^{2}v_{1t}^{2} - |\vec{v}_{1}|^{2}}\sqrt{c^{2}v_{12t}^{2} - |\vec{v}_{2}|^{2}}$$

The above two relations have been written from (1) where we have considered the following,

$$a_1 = cv_{1t}, a_2 = |\vec{v}_1|, b_1 = cv_{2t}, b_2 = |\vec{v}_2|$$

[suffix 't' denotes the time component]

But
$$c^2 v_{1t}^2 - v_{1t}^2 v_{2t}^2 = c^2$$
; $c^2 v_{12t}^2 - v_{1t}^2 v_{2t}^2 = c^2$

The first inequality gives us

$$c^2 v_{1t} \cdot v_{2t} - |\vec{v}_1| |\vec{v}_2| \ge c^2$$

Now

$$v_1.v_2 = c^2 v_{1t}.v_{2t} - |\vec{v}_1||\vec{v}_2|Cos\theta$$

If $0 < Cos\theta < 1$.

$$\begin{split} c^2 v_{1t}. \, v_{2t} - |\vec{v}_1| |\vec{v}_2| Cos\theta &> c^2 v_{1t}. \, v_{2t} - |\vec{v}_1| |\vec{v}_2| > c^2 \\ \\ c^2 v_{1t}. \, v_{2t} - |\vec{v}_1| |\vec{v}_2| Cos\theta &> c^2 \\ \\ v_1. \, v_2 &> c^2 \end{split}$$

If
$$-1 < Cos\theta < 0$$
.

$$c^2 v_{1t}. \, v_{2t} - |\vec{v}_1| |\vec{v}_2| Cos\theta > c^2 v_{1t}. \, v_{2t} - |\vec{v}_1| |\vec{v}_2| > c^2 [\text{since } Cos\theta \text{ is negative}]$$

$$c^2 v_{1t}. \, v_{2t} - |\vec{v}_1| |\vec{v}_2| Cos\theta > c^2$$

$$v_1$$
. $v_2 > c^2$

If $Cos\theta = 1$,

$$c^2 v_{1t} \cdot v_{2t} - |\vec{v}_1| |\vec{v}_2| \ge c^2$$

Therefore in general:

$$v_1.v_2 > c^2$$
 (3)

Let us consider the second inequality

$$2)c^2v_{1t}.v_{2t} - |\vec{v}_1||\vec{v}_2| \leq -\sqrt{c^2{v_{1t}}^2 - |\vec{v}_1|^2}\sqrt{c^2{v_{12t}}^2 - |\vec{v}_2|^2}$$

If $v_1=v_2$ this inequality reduces to $v^2\leq -c^2$ which is not true. So we may dismiss the second inequality

Alternative considerations:

If possible let

$$v_1$$
. $v_2 < c^2$

Or,

$$c^2 v_{1t} \cdot v_{2t} - \vec{v}_1 \cdot \vec{v}_2 < c^2$$

We transform to a frame of reference where $ec{v}_1=0$

We now have,

$$c^2 v_{1t} \cdot v_{2t} < c^2$$

Now

$$v_{1t} = \frac{dt_1}{d\tau} = \gamma_1; v_{2t} = \frac{dt_2}{d\tau} = \gamma_2$$

Therefore

$$\begin{split} c^2 v_{1t}. \, v_{2t} &= c^2 \gamma_1 \gamma_2 \\ c^2 v_{1t}. \, v_{2t} &< c^2 \Rightarrow c^2 \gamma_1 \gamma_2 < c^2 \\ \gamma_1 \gamma_2 &< 1 \end{split}$$

But $\gamma_1 = 1$ since $\vec{v}_1 = 0$

$$\Rightarrow \gamma_2 < 1$$

The above relation is an impossible relation since γ cannot be less than unity.

Therefore,

$$v_1. v_2 \ge c^2$$

Dot Product of Two Four Moments

Next we pass on to the dot product of four momenta^[3]

$$p_1, p_2 = E_1, E_1 - c^2 \vec{p}_1, \vec{p}_2$$
 (4)

If possible let

$$p_1. p_2 < m_1 m_2 c^4$$

where m_{1} and m_{2} are the rest masses of the two particles.

We transform to a frame of reference where the velocity of the first particle, $\vec{v}_1=0$: $\Rightarrow \vec{p}_1=0$

Therefore

$$E_1.E_1 < m_1 m_2 c^4$$

$$\Rightarrow m_1 \gamma_1 c^2 m_2 \gamma_2 c^2 < m_1 m_2 c^4$$
$$\Rightarrow \gamma_1 \gamma_2 < 1$$

But the product of the gammas cannot be less than unity

Therefore

$$p_1.p_2 \not< m_1^2 c^4$$

Alternative considerations:

Let
$$a_1 = E_1; a_2 = c|\vec{p}_1|; b_1 = E_2; b_2 = c|\vec{p}_2|$$

Considring (1) we have

$$(E_1 E_2 - c^2 |\vec{p}_1| |\vec{p}_2|)^2 \ge (E_1^2 - c^2 |\vec{p}_1|) (E_2^2 - c^2 |\vec{p}_2|) = m_1^2 c^4 m_2^2 c^4$$

Therefore

$$(E_1E_2 - c^2|\vec{p}_1||\vec{p}_2|) \ge m_1m_2c^4 \text{ or } (E_1E_2 - c^2|\vec{p}_1||\vec{p}_2|) \le -m_1m_2c^4$$

If $p_1 = p_2$ we have for the second inequality

$$|E_1|^2 - c^2 |\vec{p}_1|^2 \le -m_1 m_2 c^4$$

So we discard the second inequality

$$|E_1 E_2 - c^2 |\vec{p}_1| |\vec{p}_2| \ge \sqrt{|E_1|^2 - c^2 |\vec{p}_1|} \sqrt{|E_2|^2 - c^2 |\vec{p}_2|} = m_1 m_2 c^4$$

We have

$$\begin{split} E_1 E_2 - c^2 |\vec{p}_1| |\vec{p}_2| &\geq m_1 m_2 c^4 \\ p_{1.} p_2 &= E_1 E_2 - c^2 |\vec{p}_1| |\vec{p}_2| Cos\theta \\ \\ E_1 E_2 - c^2 |\vec{p}_1| |\vec{p}_2| Cos\theta &\geq E_1 E_2 - c^2 |\vec{p}_1| |\vec{p}_2| \end{split}$$

Therefore

$$p_{1}p_{2} \ge m_{1}m_{2}c^{4}$$

$$E_{1}E_{2} - c^{2}\vec{p}_{1}.\vec{p}_{2} \ge m_{1}m_{2}c^{4}$$
 (6)

Further Consequences

From (5) we have

$$\begin{split} m_1 \gamma_1 c^2 m_2 \gamma_2 c^2 - c^2 m_1 m_1 \gamma_1 \gamma_2 \vec{v}_1 . \, \vec{v}_2 &\geq m_1 m_2 c^4 \\ \gamma_1 \gamma_2 (c^2 - \vec{v}_1 . \, \vec{v}_2) &\geq c^2 \\ \\ c^2 - \vec{v}_1 . \, \vec{v}_2 &\geq \frac{c^2}{\gamma_1 \gamma_2} \\ \\ - \vec{v}_1 . \, \vec{v}_2 &\geq -c^2 + \frac{c^2}{\gamma_1 \gamma_2} \end{split}$$

Four dot product v_1 . v_2 is given by

$$\begin{split} v_1.\,v_2 &= c^2 v_{t1}.\,v_{t2} - \vec{v}_1.\,\vec{v}_2 = c^2 \gamma_1.\,\gamma_2 - \vec{v}_1.\,\vec{v}_2 \geq c^2 \gamma_1.\,\gamma_2 - c^2 + \frac{c^2}{\gamma_1\gamma_2} \\ \\ v_1.\,v_2 &\geq c^2 \left(\gamma_1\gamma_2 - 1 + \frac{1}{\gamma_1\gamma_2}\right) \end{split}$$

If $\vec{v}_1 = \vec{v}_2$ then $\gamma_1 = \gamma_2$

$$v.v = c^2 \left(\gamma^2 - 1 + \frac{1}{\gamma^2} \right)$$
 (7)

But the correct result is $v \cdot v = c^2$

Thus we have arrived at a contradiction.

Conclusion

As claimed we have that the four dot product between two arbitrary velocities is less than the square of the speed of light in vacuum and the product of two four momenta is less than the product of the two masses involved and the square of the speed of light[in vacuuo]

References

- 1. Wikipedia, Four Velocity, https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Four-velocity
- 2. Janet C,MIT Course, https://uspas.fnal.gov/materials/12MSU/Conrad_4vector.pdf
- 3. Wikipedia, Four Momentum, https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Four-momentum